Urban Development and Displacement in Addis Ababa: The Impact of Resettlement Projects on Low-Income Households

Gebre Yntiso

Eastern Africa Social Science Research Review, Volume 24, Number 2, June 2008, pp. 53-77 (Article)

Published by Organization for Social Science Research in Eastern and Southern Africa

DOI: 10.1353/eas.0.0001

For additional information about this article
http://muse.jhu.edu/journals/eas/summary/v024/24.2.yntiso.html
URBAN DEVELOPMENT AND DISPLACEMENT IN ADDIS ABABA: THE IMPACT OF RESETTLEMENT PROJECTS ON LOW-INCOME HOUSEHOLDS

Gebre Yntiso

Abstract: Addis Ababa, the capital of Ethiopia, is undergoing a major transformation as evidenced by the development of road networks, schools, healthcare institutions, hotels, condominiums, real estates, banks, shopping centres, and many other businesses. There is a sense of jubilation on the part of authorities and the general public with the direction of the urban development policy and the remarkable gains scored thus far. What remains unnoticed, however, is that thousands of low-income households have been displaced and adversely affected by the process of urban development. The process of relocating people from the inner city to new resettlement sites in the outskirts have disrupted the relocatees' business ties with customers, broken their informal networks of survival, caused loss of locational advantage and jobs and incurred high transport costs. The overwhelming majority of relocatees reported significant income decline. Many displaced households have encountered problems related to water, sanitation, education, and healthcare. Farmers, who lost their land to investors and new resettlers complained about low compensation and lack of other economic options to make a living. In short, progress in Addis Ababa has been exacerbating poverty among a section of the population. This paper, based on a fieldwork conducted in 2006/7, describes the socio-economic and infrastructural changes the City has been experiencing since recent years, examines the impact of the urban development policy and practice on displaced low-income households, and provides recommendations that authorities should consider to minimize development-induced livelihood disruptions.

Keywords: Addis Ababa, urban development, displacement, resettlement, low-income households

1. INTRODUCTION

An inadequate master plan, poor housing facilities, environmental problems, and shanty corners, among others, characterize urban centres of developing countries (Potts 1997; Rabinovitch 1998; Meheret 1999; Dierig 1999; Kamete, Tostensen, and Tvedten 2001). In order to solve these
problems and create a conducive environment for investment, government authorities tend to re-order urban space, which would require changes in urban land use. This process often causes the displacement (relocation and resettlement) of certain households, in most cases the powerless low-income people. Carried away by the euphoria of nation building, policymakers tend to view the disruptive effects of urban development on certain sections of society as justified sacrifices for the greater good. In other words, there is a tendency to view development-induced displacement as an unintended impact, unavoidable step, or a necessary evil. Hence, the plight of thousands of displaced households failed to attract adequate policy attention.

Addis Ababa has been witnessing major transformations as evidenced by phenomenal public and private investments since the 1990s. The strategic development framework of the City provides a ten-year (2001-2010) policy and development direction. According to the Master Plan Revision Office of Addis Ababa (ORAAMP 2002, 48), housing, slum upgrading, the development of inner city, construction of roads, establishment of industries and warehouses, and protection and development of the environment are the six priority strategic development goals to be achieved during the ten-year plan. Arkebe Oqubay (2005), the former Mayor of Addis Ababa, provided detailed reports on the efforts made by his administration to undertake four policy reforms to improve the overall urban governance. These include decentralisation, community participation, civil service reform, and improved service delivery. There is a sense of cheerfulness on the part of authorities and the general public with the direction of the urban development policy and the remarkable achievements. What remains unnoticed, however, is the consequent displacement of predominantly low-income households from the inner city and farmers residing in the outskirts. Esayas Wolde-Meskel (2004) stated that people who were forcibly displaced by the ring road from Megenagna area experienced loss of income, increased housing rent, transportation problem, inadequate health services, and school problems, as children had to travel back to their old school at least in the first year of their relocation. Similar later studies by postgraduate students of Addis Ababa University revealed that the recent urban development programmes have been disrupting the livelihoods of thousands of households (Fitsum 2007; Ambuye 2006; Berhanu 2006; Dejene 2005; Feleke 2004).

The inner city relocatees may be divided into four categories: owner-occupiers, public tenants (those who lived in public rental houses), subtenants (those who sublet rooms from public tenants), and tenants of private premises. Most owner-occupiers were given land replacement and cash compensation. Subtenants of public houses and tenants of landlords
did not qualify for replacement houses or rehabilitation support. The public tenants, the focus of the present study, were given only replacement houses (no rehabilitation assistance). While some of them moved to the site/house of their choices, many were forced to accept smaller spaces and fewer bedrooms, worse locations, and/or higher rental fees. Because of their relocation away from the inner city, most households experienced different hardships, such as decline/loss of income, poor access to educational and health services, transport problems, and breakdown of social networks. Beyond the tenants, subtenants, and owner-occupiers, the urban development programmes affected farm communities in the suburbs, who lost land to investors and new resettlers. Some farmers complained about inadequate compensation and lack of other economic options to make a living. It appears that the recent progress in Addis Ababa has been causing or exacerbating poverty among a section of the population.

The main objective of this paper is to describe the major transformations that Addis Ababa has been undergoing since the 1990s, to examine the side effects of an urban development policy and practice on low-income households forcibly resettled in the outskirts, and to provide feasible policy recommendations to avoid or at least minimize future risks of development-induced livelihood disruptions. Similar studies were conducted (not yet published) by postgraduate students of Addis Ababa University (see Gebre 2007, 31-33 for the summary of these studies). The present article, which has benefited from the other works, can be distinguished on the basis of its comprehensiveness, representativeness, and systematic analysis and presentation of data.

The present study focused on households who have been relocated from public houses in the inner city to 14 relocation sites in the outskirts. The 14 villages are officially known as: Akaki 1, Akaki 2, Altad, Amanuel, Asko, Bethel, Birchiqo Fabrika, Bole Bulbula, CMC, Gerji, Gurara (also Film Maikel), Sallo Giorgis, Serti 1, and Serti 2. While the 12 sites were established and managed by the City Administration, Altad and Birchiqo Fabrika resettlement sites have been handled by MIDROC (Mohammed International Development Research and Organization Companies) and MEWIT (Merchandise Wholesale and Import Trade Enterprise) respectively. Due to time and financial constraints, the research was conducted in five randomly selected villages: Akaki 1 and 2 in Kebele 02/04 of Akaki-Kality Sub-City, Altad in Kebele 14/15 of Bole Sub-City, Asko in Kebele 15/16 of Kolfe-Kerniyo Sub-City, and Gurara in Kebele 03/04 of Yeka Sub-City (see Figure 1).

2. METHODOLOGY

Both qualitative and quantitative data collection techniques were employed.
The qualitative method included observation, key informant interviews, and focus group discussions. A total of 24 people were interviewed, and most of the interviewees came from Akaki and Gurara resettled villages. Authorities at Kebele and City Administration levels and few peri-urban farmers were also interviewed. Most key informants were randomly selected from among the residents, while a few others were contacted because of their access to relevant information or reported knowledge of the relocation process. Interviewees were asked about the process of the relocation, decision-making and participation, economic losses/gains, valuation of property and compensation, provision of replacement houses, availability and accessibility of social services and physical infrastructure, breakdown/establishment of social networks, adaptive strategies, etc. Five focus group discussions were held largely with the resettlers: two in Gurara and three in Akaki. The quantitative method involved a sample survey, for which about a 12 per cent sample population (447 households) was selected using the systematic sampling procedure. The total population of the displaced households was estimated at 3746, and this figure was pieced together from different sources, as no official statistics could be obtained from the City Government of Addis Ababa (CGAA).

3. THE STUDY AREA: ADDIS ABABA

The City Administration of Addis Ababa estimated the population of the city at 2,923,615. The total area is 540 sq km, out of which 18,174 sq km is rural (Wubshet 2002, 101; Meheret 1999, 2). The city, which lies between 1800 and 3200 meters above sea level, is located at 90° 2' N and 38° 45' E. The lowest and the highest annual average temperatures of the city are 9.89°C and 24.64°C respectively. The annual average rainfall is 1178 mm (Dierig 1999). Addis Ababa is the home of various ethnic groups: 48.3 per cent Amhara, 19.6 per cent Oromo, 17.5 per cent Gurage, 7.6 per cent Tigray, and 6.9 per cent others (Golini et al. 2001, 128). Regarding religion, 82 per cent of the population is Orthodox Christians, 12.7 per cent Muslims, 3.9 per cent Protestants, 0.8 per cent Catholics, and 0.6 per cent followers of other religions. Some 93.6 per cent of the men and 79.9 per cent of the women in the city are literate (CSA and ORC Macro 2005, 35-36). The same report revealed that 68.9 per cent of the men and 44.2 per cent of the women are employed. Some 96.2 per cent of the city’s households have tap water and 34.4 per cent own houses (Golini et al. 2001).

Concerning the economy, the city’s residents engage in diverse activities, including trade and commerce, manufacturing and industry, homeowners of different types, civil administration, transport and communication, social services (education, health, etc.), hotel and catering services, and farming (agriculture, horticulture, and animal husbandry).
Addis Ababa is the diplomatic capital of Africa with more than 90 embassies and consular representatives, which makes it the fourth diplomatic centre in the world. The city has been serving as the Headquarters of the United Nations Economic Commission for Africa (UNECA) since 1988 and the former Organization of African Union (now the African Union) since 1963.

Meheret Ayenew (1999, 1) wrote, “Addis Ababa is a fast growing urban centre that is beset with problems afflicting most cities in the developing world, including extensive poverty, joblessness, inadequate housing, severe overcrowding/congestion and undeveloped physical infrastructure.” According to Sandra Dierig (1999), pollution, poverty and environmentally induced hazards are among the major problems threatening the health and life of the majority of the city’s inhabitants, particularly the urban poor. The author wrote, “Especially in the last few years urban poverty in Addis Ababa has increased tremendously… an increase from 45-63% between 1993 and 1995… Unemployment, very poor housing, sanitation and water supply, and insufficient health care are rampant problems…. The number of homeless is said to be 40,000” (Dierig 1999, 52). The reports by Meheret (1999), Dierig (1999), Kamete, Tostensen, and Tvedten (2001), Golini et al. (2001), Wubshet (2002), UN-Habitat (2004; 2007), and others reveal the presence of many other problems: an estimated 85 per cent of the population is believed to live in slums; 85 per cent of the housing stock is located in unplanned areas; 41 per cent of the households earn less than ETB 13 per day (approximately equivalent to USD 1.52); about 35 per cent live below poverty line; 25.2 per cent do not have indoor toilets; only 60 per cent of the demand for water has been met and the unemployment rate is 30-35 per cent among other things.
Figure 1. Location Map of the Study Kebeles
4. RESETTLEMENT APPROACHES AND ARGUMENTS

4.1 Policy Approaches to Resettlement

Some international/regional organizations and some national governments have developed clear resettlement policies. The most widely known and increasingly adopted policy is the World Bank’s Involuntary Resettlement Policy. This policy emphasizes that people affected by development projects should be able to improve, or at least be as well-off after the project as without the project. The policy also specifies that the absence of a legal title to land and other assets should not prevent affected people from receiving compensation, and that the amount of compensation should be sufficient to replace lost assets, incomes, and living standards. The commitments to the policy provisions are also based on poverty reduction objectives. Borrowers are required to abide by the resettlement policy of the Bank. From this it is apparent that the Bank treats resettlement as an entry point for sustainable development.

It is important to develop a national resettlement policy framework as a safeguard mechanism against displacement disasters or to protect the interest of affected people. Experience from Asia and Latin America reveal that in countries where appropriate resettlement policies exist, the adverse effects of displacement were averted (Agrawal 2000; Mejia 1999). There is a growing recognition that resettlement projects should involve communities, CBOs, NGOs, the private sector, and other stakeholders. Given the inevitability of large-scale urban displacements in the future, Ethiopia needs to develop a resettlement policy with clear guidelines and procedures, and involve relevant stakeholders and partners in resettlement operations.

4.2 Poverty-Urbanization Link

Urbanization in developing countries has been accompanied by an alarming growth in the level of poverty (Potts 1997; Rabinovitch 1998; Meheret 1999; Kamete, Tostensen, and Tvedten 2001). According to Rabinovitch (1998, 21), “Today, one out of four urban dwellers lives in absolute poverty; another one in four is classified as relatively poor.” Potts (1997, 449-450) wrote, “Most residents of African cities are poor by any standards…many surveys…show quite clearly how urban incomes have been devastated…”. A study conducted by Kamete and associates (2001) revealed that poverty is increasingly an attribute of urbanization, and that in Africa there is no apparent correlation between urbanization and national economic development. The World Bank that used to firmly assert the existence of a positive relationship between urbanization and economic development has now admitted that sub-Saharan Africa has been a notable
exception to the rule that national economic growth is closely correlated with urbanization (World Bank 2000 in Kamete, Tostensen, and Tvedten 2001, 12). The Bank is reported to have concluded that African cities are not serving as engines of growth and structural transformation (Ibid). The study by Kamete and associates, which covered Ethiopia and 23 other countries, concluded that the growth of economies in the 24 countries is not able to match urban population growth (Ibid: 16).

Until recently, urban poverty received little attention partly because of the prevailing conventional conception that poverty is a predominantly rural phenomenon. Moreover, urban people are believed to earn higher income, have better access to infrastructural facilities and social services, and generally enjoy higher standards of living as compared to their rural counterparts. This perception was highly influenced by Michael Lipton’s (1977) theory of ‘urban bias.’ The views that poverty is a rural problem and urban areas are well-off seem to have led to ‘rural bias’ until the 1980s. According to Potts (1997, 450), “significantly there is now much evidence that average rural incomes frequently exceed the incomes available from most formal wage work” in urban areas. Although the ‘urban bias’ perception has been changing, the plight of the urban poor, particularly those displaced by urban development projects, has failed to attract meaningful policy and research attention.

Urban development and renewal programmes often target slums and shantytowns normally inhabited by low-income households. Compared to suburbs, income generating opportunities and social services are often concentrated in such areas. Therefore, relocation of low-income households from inner cities to the outskirts would, undoubtedly, affect their livelihoods and informal networks of mutual assistance, their critical coping strategies (Lourenço-Lindel 2001). It has been widely agreed that people dislocated from inner cities are likely to lose important locational advantages linked to their survival (Davidson et al. 1993). In view of this fact, it is important to support the reestablishment of project affected people as matter of right rather than as a humanitarian act of benevolence. Smitu Kothari (1995, 1) rightly stated, “An improvement in the lives of those whom a project otherwise imposes severe costs in order to create benefits for others should be considered an entitlement, not an act of reluctant generosity”, Cernea (1989, 89) also argued that “the involuntariness of relocation…makes it incumbent upon the responsible government agencies to provide to the affected people the options and resources necessary to get fully re-established”.

4.3 Compensation as a Development Strategy

The World Bank, the Asian Development Bank, and some Latin American countries based resettlement compensation policies on social vulnerability to avoid economic impoverishment of citizens (Agrawal 2000, 5; Mejía 1999, 155-6). The discourse on compensation has moved from who should be compensated for what and how adequate to linking resettlement and development. Cernea convincingly argued that compensation payments even in the most advanced resettlement policies of the World Bank are structurally incapable of resolving the task of restoring incomes and livelihoods to where they would be in the absence of forced displacement (Cernea & Kanbor 2003). He proposes a shift from the “economics of compensation” to the “economics of resettlement with development” focused on affected peoples’ sustainable reestablishment rather than mere restitution. Mejía (1999, 156) noted, “Most current urban resettlement programmes are based only on housing replacement. Economic and social assistance programmes are mentioned only tangentially… Since involuntary displacement can destroy previous means of livelihood, all resettlement operations must be development programmes”.

The rehabilitation of displaced people goes beyond monetary compensation because it involves replacement of housing and income generating possibilities (Davidson et al. 1993). Investment in rehabilitation of displaced people should be seen as laying the foundation for sustainable development of cities, which cannot be attained in the absence of equitable and affordable access to opportunities. Janice Perlman (1998, 11) warns, “There can be no sustainable city of the 21st Century without social justice and political participation, as well as economic vitality….It is only by seeking out innovations in social equity, participatory democracy, and economic productivity…that our cities can be truly sustainable for the 21st Century and beyond”.

4.4 Stakeholder Participation

In order to restore the economic and financial vitality of cities, city officials must attract investment by companies and individuals, who as a rule operate under competitive and profitable conditions (Koebel 1996). The critical challenge for the municipal administration is how to forge partnerships with the profit-seeking private sector to minimize displacement and gentrification. Richard Tomlinson (1994, 171) indicated, “When profit-seeking behaviour occurs in public-private partnerships, municipal democracy is compromised, business control over public resource allocation is increased, and development strategy is formulated without wide participation.” The profit-hungry developers would view the presence of low-income people in the project neighbourhood as a nuisance and their
removal as a blessing (Betancur et al. 1995). This is a scenario where partnership is controlled by corporate business and where municipality is dwarfed to facilitating corporate interest.

It is in the best interest of the public to involve stakeholders (e.g., the local people, CBOs, and the private sector) and potential partners (e.g., NGOs and donors) in resettlement design. As indicated above, one of the challenges is convincing profit-minded investors to think that participation in resettlement rehabilitation is part of the business game. Agrawal (1999) noted how an urban transport project in Mumbai (India) devised a unique and innovative approach to involve the private sector in the rehabilitation of affected people through transferable development rights, purchase of readymade tenements from the Housing Board, and construction of tenements through contractors on plots obtained from government agencies. Communities and NGOs could also play central roles in urban resettlement operations. As Schübel (1996 in Dierig 1999) noted, in comparison with the situation in rural development, community participation in urban development has not been recognized as an essential component. Community participation could be manipulated to promote the agenda of certain interest groups. The other challenge is the existence of mutual suspicion between government agencies and NGOs. The literature on urban resettlement in Asia suggests that through a favourable policy environment, genuine community participation, and partnership with NGOs, the complex problem of urban resettlement could be addressed. In Ethiopia, for example, the concerns of displacees with no legal title to land and housing (e.g. squatters, sub-renters of public housing, and tenants of private landlords) could be addressed by NGOs.

5. SOME RECENT DEVELOPMENTS IN ADDIS ABABA

As indicated in the introduction, the city formulated six priority strategic development goals to be achieved during the ten-year plan (ORAAMP 2002). Arkebe Oqubay (2005), the former Mayor of Addis Ababa, reported that the City Government undertook four policy reforms aimed at improving the overall urban governance of Addis Ababa: decentralization, community participation, civil service reform, and improvement of service delivery. Regarding decentralization, the political structure was reorganized to reduce the four-tier government system to three levels (i.e. city, sub-city, and Kebele) with the lower tiers entrusted with significant power to decide on matters regarding urban development and governance of their localities, while the city-level executive mainly focused on policy-making, capacity building and regulatory tasks. To enhance community participation, the former Mayor reported, People’s Advisory Councils were established at all three levels with members drawn from all sections of society. The city’s
large civil service (that includes more than 40,000 people) was also radically reformed to improve service delivery, and ensure transparency and accountability. According to the report, at the core of this reform were decentralization of the government system and the establishment of a thin but efficient bureaucracy. The service delivery process was made more efficient and transparent.

Arkebe (2005) further noted that shelter is a serious problem not only because of an acute shortage of housing, but also that the available housing stock is of poor standard and often lacks basic facilities. It was estimated that about 300,000 new/additional homes were needed. In 2004, the City Administration started implementing a housing strategy to reduce the housing shortage in the city and make houses affordable to the low and medium income dwellers. The administration opted for introduction and use of low-cost construction technology, redevelopment and upgrading of 50 per cent of slum areas, a mixed settlement approach (to maintain the tradition of rich and poor people living in the same neighbourhood), and economic empowerment of the poor to make them owner-occupiers. In 2004/5, some 700 condominiums were constructed through a pilot project planned and executed with the support of GTZ low income housing project. Upon completion, the houses were sold to residents of Addis Ababa.

Based on the lessons from the pilot project, which triggered a huge demand for housing (417, 737 people applied), the city has been constructing 30, 239 units of affordable housing in 102 sites. Of this total, approximately 15,000 units have already been inhabited. The construction budgets for 2004/5 and 2005/6 were 36 per cent and 50 per cent of the city’s capital expenditures respectively. The city plans to construct 38,500 units in 2007/8 and up to 225,000 units until 2010 in the existing and additional seven sites. In 2005, the programme created job opportunities for 40,000 people (80% women) working in construction sites. About 1,000 small enterprises that participate in various works of the condo projects were established. As part of its poverty reduction strategy, the City Administration provided working space for 40,000 small business operators in 2004; built metal and wood workshops that could accommodate 50,000 small business operators in 2005; and established a micro-finance institution to provide credit to small businesses. In 2004, small businesses created about 65,000 new jobs in the city, while this figure more than doubled in 2005. Of the newly created jobs in 2005, women accounted for about 50% and the youth 75%.

The descriptive accounts presented in this section represent only some of the achievements that the City of Addis Ababa has witnessed in recent years. It is very important to underline the fact that impressive progresses were made in many other sectors, such as education, healthcare, road
infrastructure, and telecommunication. The ongoing public and private investments in different sectors, the ever-increasing demand for services, and the policy commitment to promote urban development indicate that the City will witness a lot more in the years to come.

6. IMPACT OF RESETTLEMENT ON LOW-INCOME HOUSEHOLDS

6.1 Income Loss/Decline

Of the 447 survey respondents, 10.5 per cent earned less than ETB 100 per month in the old villages. In the new sites, the number of households earning less than ETB 100 per month increased to 16.8 per cent. Likewise, the number of households who earned between ETB 250 and ETB 500 per month decreased from 33.3 per cent in the previous sites to 28.2 per cent in the new sites. Those who earned between ETB 500 and 1000 per month also decreased from 20.6 per cent in the old villages to 18.3 per cent in the new ones.

Respondents were asked about the main sources of household income and the breadwinners. In the old village, 37.4 per cent of the households depended largely on regular salary from the formal sector followed by wage labour (16.8 %) and pension/remittance (13.6 %). In the new villages, the percentage of households still relying on wage labour remained almost the same. However, those who reported heavy dependence on salary decreased from 37.4 per cent to 26.6. In other words, almost 11 per cent of the settlers lost their jobs due to their relocation. This result is consistent with Fitsum’s (2007, 37) research result, which revealed that the unemployment rate in the new settlement sites increased by 20 per cent. Many key informants indicated that they quit their jobs because of distance and high transport cost to get to their workplace. The survey indicates that largely male heads of households lost their jobs. The male breadwinners decreased from 47.4 per cent in the old villages to 41.8 in the new sites. The responsibility of women as breadwinners slightly increased (from 28.4 per cent to 29.3), which meant more burden on women.

According to the survey in the five resettlements sites, over 37 per cent of the households reported to have become food insecure due to the relocation. This result is also consistent with Ambaye’s (2006) census that showed that 39.7 per cent of the Gurara settlers became food insecure after their relocation. Fitsum (2007) also reported that urban displacement made certain households vulnerable to food insecurity. How do households deal with major losses of income? The quantitative analysis suggests that certain households may have made adjustments in the household division of labour and in their consumption behaviours. For example, the number of
households that depended largely on income generated by children increased from 2.7 per cent to 9.2 per cent. Many informants also indicated that their children or grandchildren dropped out of schools to support family. The resettlement created or increased pressure on some children, who have been forced to drop out or who may be performing poorly in education due to household responsibility. The other important adjustment was reliance on pension/remittance as a main source of income, and this was manifested by an increase from 13.6 per cent in the old villages to 25.3 per cent in the new sites. The meagre pension/remittance were used to buy food and other necessities that now cost more due to lack of markets in the vicinity of most resettled villages.

Displacement does not affect all displaces in the same way and/or with the same intensity. Some people may even benefit from a relocation process considered to be detrimental to the majority. For example, 9.4 per cent of the respondents reported to have become food secure. Likewise, 11.6 per cent of the respondents participated in Ambaye’s (2006) census stated that their income has increased after their relocation to Gurara. Few key informants also indicated that their incomes increased and their living conditions improved after the relocation. Getahun Shambel, who worked as a guard in a certain hotel while in his former kebele, was promoted to reception desk after the relocation of his family to Akaki. The promotion not only increased his salary but also improved his access to generous customers. Moreover, his wife got a good job, and this enabled her to make significant economic contributions to the family.

6.2 Impact on Education

A citywide baseline survey has indicated that the most important problems challenging the education sector of the City Administration of Addis Ababa are shortage of schools, uneven distribution, inconvenient location, inefficient management, lack of expansion area, and dilapidated school buildings due to lack of proper maintenance (Fitsum 2007). Since educational institutions tend to concentrate in central areas, people living in inner cities enjoy better access to educational facilities compared to those living in the suburbs. The relocation of people from Arada and Kirkos (sub-cities packed with schools and colleges) to Akaki-Kality suburbs limited their access to education. Akaki-Kality, which hosts five of the 14 resettlement sites, has the lowest number of primary schools and TVETs. It has only seven secondary schools (the second lowest after Lideta Sub-City) compared to 21 in Arada and 14 in Kirkos. The problem is not just about the number of educational institutions. The location of affordable schools and the cost of education make Akaki-Kality Sub-City an unattractive place to live in (at least from the point of view of the poor). In Akaki, for example, there are only four private kindergartens, which are reported to be
expensive for low-income households. Key informants in most settlements indicated that distance to primary and secondary schools substantially increased. Those who used to attend college programmes while in their old villages had to either bear high transport costs or drop out of the programmes.

Survey respondents were asked to compare the relative distance of their current houses to the nearest primary and secondary schools. Some 62 per cent reported that the distance to the nearest primary school is far or very far compared to the ones in their previous villages. Likewise, 86 per cent indicated that the relative distance to the nearest high school is far or very far. According to Ambaye (2006), 82 per cent of the respondents reported that their children walked to schools in the old villages. In the new sites, however, only 24.5 per cent indicated that their children walk to schools. The author further noted that students who relied on buses increased from 7.3 per cent in the old settlements to 64.6 per cent in the new. One of the implications of the relocation process is that a significant number of parents, whose children used to walk to school, have to allocate a budget for transport.

Distance to schools affected many households in a variety of ways. Some 11.4 per cent of the respondents reported incidence of school dropouts. Several key informants also mentioned that their children dropped out of schools particularly during the first and second years of their relocation. The reasons for school dropouts were explained in terms of the need to support family and/or high transport cost. Informants in Akaki complained that authorities failed to meet their promise to provide free bus tickets to students for one year. Ambaye (2006, 82) wrote, “children have assumed the responsibility of supporting the declining income of the household… This has affected their education negatively and many children are forced to drop out of school….17.2% of the households have reported that there is at least one case of dropout in the household”.

6.3 Impact on Health Services

The citywide baseline survey identified problems in health service delivery in Addis Ababa. These include shortage of health service facilities, uneven distribution of health services, shortage of trained manpower, and financial limitation and inadequacy (Fitsum 2007). The public and NGO-operated healthcare facilities are concentrated in the city centre, largely inhabited by low-income households. The urban development programme caused the relocation of people from sub-cities (e.g., Arada, Kirkos, and Yeka) located in central Addis Ababa and with a large concentration of affordable public healthcare facilities to frontier Sub-Cities (e.g. Akaki-Kality, Bole, and Kolfe-Keranio) where such facilities are either scarce or unaffordable. It is
important to note that 10 of the 14 new settlements are found in Bole, Akaki-Kality, and Kolfe-Keranio. For 83 per cent of the respondents, the distance from current homes to the nearest affordable healthcare facility (relative to the distance in the old villages) is far or very far. In Akaki, for instance, one would need to drive for more than an hour to get to the nearest hospital (Fitsum 2007).

The statistics (from the Health Bureau, CGAA) on the distribution of healthcare facilities by sub-city supports the argument that the resettlement programme reduced access to health services. For example, in 2007 there were 30 hospitals and 450 clinics in Addis Ababa. Akaki-Kality had the lowest number of hospitals and clinics. There are only 30 healthcare institutions (hospitals, health centres, clinics, and health posts combined) in this particular sub-city (which hosts most of the relocatees) compared with 81 in Kirkos and 78 in Arada – the two major sub-cities. Healthcare centres operated by government organizations and NGOs provide affordable services. Unfortunately, Akaki-Kality, unlike Arada and Kirkos sub-cities, lacks government-run hospitals and clinics and NGO-operated health institutions.

6.4 Impact on Social Networks

Membership in community organizations such as idir (funeral associations), iqub (saving/credit groups), and mahber (religious groupings) is indispensable for low-income households because it represents a dependable social security arrangement. Prior to the relocation, about 93 per cent of households were members of idir associations in their respective villages. Following their dislocation, except for 5.6 per cent who discontinued membership, the majority struggled either to keep their membership in the old and/or join new idir associations. Over 17 per cent of the respondents travelled as a group or came from the same neighbourhood and thus maintained their old association; 34 per cent joined/form ed a new idir in the new site; 39.4 per cent maintained double affiliation (with old and new), and 5.4 per cent remained members of old idir institutions.

Informants explained how difficult it has been to maintain membership in the old idir and/or join new ones. The problem was particularly severe among those who were relocated as individuals dispersed to different sites. For example, two informants found it difficult to join a new idir association in Gurara because they could not afford the entrance fee - ETB 300. Hence, both decided to maintain affiliation with their respective idirs in their old villages. However, they could not maintain meaningful or close interaction due to the long distance between the current and the old villages. Some of those who maintained double membership also complained that the idir has become a liability as they have to pay the monthly fees and participate at
least in the major functions of the two associations. A sense of attachment to the old villages, high entrance fee in the new sites, and lack of knowledge of new neighbours forced many people to cling to the old.

How important is a neighbourhood organization in terms of dealing with urban resettlement problems? There are reports that idir organizations supported members in dire condition. In one of the Akaki sites, a woman (single mother) who used to commute to downtown daily to do street vending, fell seriously sick. She had no money for medical treatment, feed her infirm father and her young child, and pay house rent and utility bills. Her idir association not only exempted her from monthly contributions, but also provided financial assistance that enabled her to get medical treatment and pay the house rent. One key informant noted that although the association was pleased to provide such assistance, it was becoming increasingly difficult to do so because the relocation process made a significant number of people poorer.

6.5 Transportation Problems

Most villages are located far away from nurseries, primary/secondary schools, healthcare facilities, and market places. The necessity to travel to the workplace, market, school, and other places has required the allocation of a budget for transportation. In Akaki, relocatees walked 15-20 minutes to the bus stop. Those commuting back to the inner city for work have reported leaving their homes as early as at 4:00 am to queue up for the bus.

While in the old villages, 37.6 per cent of the households walked to their workplace, followed by 27.7 per cent who were bus customers, and about 21.5 per cent who used any means available. In the new sites, on the contrary, the number of households relying on buses increased from 27.7 per cent to 61.3 per cent. Those who walked dropped from 37.6 per cent to 2.5 per cent because of the long distance to be covered. The number of people using taxis also decreased by half (from 12.5% to 6.3%), and this trend could be explained mainly by high costs that discouraged people from travelling by taxi. The long distance travel and the high cost of transportation forced some relocatees to quit their jobs. For example, Fitsum (2007, 38) reported that one of his informants continued to work for Tesfa Laboratory after relocation and earned ETB 120.00 per month. However, she was forced to quit her job because 62.5 per cent of her monthly income was spent on transportation. Another informant also said she quit her job because retaining it demanded leaving her house before 5:30 am, and this presented a security concern.

Respondents were asked to characterize the relative monthly transport expenses in the new sites as “very high”, “a little high”, “almost the same”, and “a little low”. About 78 per cent responded that their transport cost in
the new villages was very high, 16.6 per cent reported a little high, and 5 per cent said almost the same. In short, 94 per cent of the households spent more money on transportation in the new villages. Thus it stands to reason that planners should calculate the transportation costs of travelling to the workplace, school, etc. to avert the adverse effects of the urban resettlement.

5.6 Housing Concerns

It is to be recalled that in 1975, the then government of Ethiopia nationalized urban rental houses and reduced the rent by 50 per cent. Since then the public tenants have been paying low rents. The 1984 national census showed that 56.3 per cent of occupants renting houses paid ETB 1.00–9.00 per month and those who lived in 28 per cent paid ETB 10.00–59.00 per month (CSA 1991, 376). In 1984, over 60% of the houses in Addis Ababa were rental housing units that belonged to the government (Ibid, 374). According to Ambaye (2006), 93.7 per cent of the displaced households currently living in Gurara used to live (prior to their relocation) in rental Kebele houses paying an average of ETB 5.9 per month.

The survey shows that in the old villages, 46 per cent of the households paid less than ETB 10.00, about 21 per cent paid between ETB 10.00 and 39.00, and only 7.6 per cent paid over ETB 40.00 per month. In the new settlements, on the contrary, 51.2 per cent paid over ETB 40.00 per month and only 16.5 per cent paid less than that. The monthly minimum and maximum house rent of government-built replacement houses is ETB 45.00 and ETB 99.00 respectively. However, this rule does not apply to the residents of Altad village, who continue to pay the same amount that they used to pay prior to their relocation. Regarding space, informants in all villages but Altad complained that they are squeezed in fewer/smaller rooms than they used to have. In the old villages, 47 per cent of the respondents lived in single bed-room houses. In the new sites, the number of households living in single bed-room houses increased to 65.5 per cent.

According to informants, the guideline for allocation of houses for dislocates, which they were told would take family size into account, was not followed. The guideline provided that a house with one bedroom should be given to households with 1-3 family members; two bedrooms to households with 4-6 family members; and three bedrooms to those with six or more family members. Firstly, most resettlement sites do not have three bedroom houses. Hence, households with six or more members were forced to live in one bedroom units that lack many of the facilities that standard one bedroom houses have. Secondly, the displacing agencies (e.g. the CGAA, the Ethiopian Electric Power Corporation, the Ethiopian Telecommunications Corporation, and the Ethiopian Road Authority)
provided replacement houses that were at their disposal at any given time. Therefore, some households with four or more members were given R type houses, which do not qualify to be considered as studios. On the positive side, 90 per cent of the respondents noted that the houses in the new settlements were of higher quality compared with their former houses in the old villages. Moreover, 24.6 per cent of the households bought the new houses from the government. It is important to note that some households sold their houses and left the resettlement sites; and the new owners significantly improved the houses/compounds.

6.7 Inadequate Physical Infrastructure

In addition to income/employment generation opportunities and social services, relocatees need some basic physical infrastructures useful for urban life. These include electricity, water supply, sanitation, garbage disposal, surface water drainage, road network and telephone line. The study shows that electricity and telephone lines are not in short supply, although many households do not have a telephone for economic reasons rather than supply shortages. Settlers in Gurara reported serious drinking water shortage. In the old villages, 98.8 per cent had tap water in their house or within a 15 minute round-trip walking distance. In the resettlement sites, 74.5 per cent of the households have tap water in their houses or are within walking distance from one. The remaining 26.5 per cent of the households have to travel further, queue up for long periods, and eight per cent of them reported fetching drinking water from rivers. In Gurara, there are two public water points connected to the city pipeline. However, water is available only once a week, or two weeks, or sometimes even once in a month. Hence, most people travel by taxi to buy water, while others fetch it from the nearby spring or the Tinsis River.

Regarding toilets, 68 per cent of the respondents reported that the latrines in the new sites were much better than their old latrines. While 20 per cent felt no difference, 10.7 per cent reported serious toilet problems in the new sites. It appears that communal latrines shared by several households tend to fill fast, particularly during the rainy season because of a rise in the level of underground water. In Gurara and Gerji resettlements, the researcher observed overflowing communal toilets posing health concerns for households in the vicinity. In Gerji, informants reported using plastic bags for human waste collection when the latrines fill up.

Concerning roads, the main problem lies in peripheral areas where access roads are in short supply. As UN-Habitat (2007, 35) reported, “the older and unplanned inner parts of the city are better served by access roads than newer, outer and planned areas.” For example, there are no taxi and bus services to the Akaki and Kality resettlement sites. People have to walk
long distances or take horse-driven carts to get to bus/taxi stops. The problem of garbage disposal and surface water drainage were found to be serious problems in some villages. For example, in Gurara, there were two full dumpsters that had not been collected for several months. The residents therefore were forced to dump their garbage near the dumpsters and other open spaces. There could not be any doubt that this could be a recipe for a health disaster.

Informants in Akaki complained about the absence of markets and grinding mills in the area. People have to travel long distances and pay for transportation to get mill services and purchase necessities. Informants from other sites also reported to have experienced similar problems. The survey respondents had other dissatisfactions as well. Almost 79 per cent of them reported to have been forced or enticed to move out of their previous homes. This is consistent with Ambaye’s (2006, 55) report, which indicates that 78.1 per cent of the displaced people described the displacement process as an involuntary process. Authorities had promised to provide free bus tickets for a year; transfer their previous telephone lines to the new sites free of charge; and provide infrastructures and social services. Some 34 per cent of the survey respondents indicated that those promises were not met. Fifteen per cent reported having stopped or cutting down on going to places of worship after their relocation, and over 13 per cent found the new sites to be unsafe.

7. CONCLUSION

The City Government of Addis Ababa has been promoting private and public investments to address such development challenges as poverty, overcrowding and congestion, dilapidated housing, inadequate housing, sanitation problems, insufficient health care, inadequate educational provision, and unemployment. In the last 15 years, the city has scored enormous achievements in attracting public and private investments, especially in infrastructure and the social sector. The challenge is that some people seem to enjoy the gains, while others are condemned to bear the pains of displacement and livelihood disruptions. Low-income households relying on the informal sector, often located in slum parts of the inner city, have been displaced in large numbers. The informal sector employs about 51 per cent of the economically active labour force (UN-Habitat 2007, 25). The available statistics reveal that social services and infrastructural facilities are concentrated in the inner city. Therefore, the relocation of people from the slums to the outskirts of the city led to loss of income and decline of access to services and facilities. It would be against development philosophy to create a new poverty regime while proclaiming to abolish/curtail it. When development projects entail population
displacement, the consequent resettlement programmes should be designed in such a way that they would improve the living standards of the affected communities as a matter of right and necessity.

In Ethiopia, urban development appears to be the order of the day, and will remain an on-going process for decades to come. The survey undertaken for this research reveals that urban displacement increased in the period from 1991 to 2005. Some 12 per cent of the respondents were relocated in the 1991-95 period, 24 per cent in the following five years, and 60 per cent in 2001-2005. There are indications that more new projects and the expansion of existing ones will displace more people. For example, the Lease Board of Addis Ababa City Administration awarded Sheraton Addis 37.7 ha to commence its expansion project, which is expected to displace 12,585 people living in 2,797 homes, 604 of which are privately owned (Wudineh 2006). In a televised press conference in the context of the Ethiopian Millennium celebration, Prime Minister Meles Zenawi indicated that 70 per cent of the houses in Addis Ababa would be demolished and rebuilt. The Prime Minister promised that displaced people will be relocated to condominium housing. Since the rehabilitation of displacees takes more than replacement housing, it is important to design sound strategies to minimize the adverse effects of development-induced urban resettlement.

There is a need to develop comprehensive national/regional resettlement laws and regulations in collaboration with communities, potential partners (e.g. NGOs), the private sector, and donor agencies. It is essential to involve the stakeholders and partners not only in resettlement policy formulation but also in project planning, design, and implementation. Loss/decline of income could be averted through interim remedial support programmes, such as cash/food delivery, reduction of house rent, provision of free access to public transport, and exemption from utility bills. Secondly, people could be resettled near viable commercial and/or industrial areas that can serve as an alternative option for generating income and employment. Thirdly, the CGAA could reserve space near resettlements to attract investment or encourage local businesses, thereby creating a conducive environment for employment and service provision. Fourthly, the distance between the old and the new villages should have been close enough so that the relocated people could easily go to the old villages to work, maintain social networks, and access social services until the new sites are fully developed. Finally, NGOs and the private sector could innovatively be encouraged to participate in urban resettlement rehabilitation.
NOTES

1. This article is a result of a research project sponsored by the Department of Sociology and Social Anthropology (SOSA) at Addis Ababa University and the Chr. Michelsen Institute (CMI) of Norway. Acknowledgements are due to SOSA and CMI for their assistance. The author wants to thank the City Administration of Addis Ababa, the Offices of Akaki-Kality, Bole, Kolfe-Keranio, and Yeka Sub-Cities, and several Kebele administrations for their cooperation in providing information and writing support letters. Acknowledgements are due to all informants for sharing their experiences. The author wants to recognize the anonymous reviewers for their time and constructive comments that enriched the final version of this article.


4. The World Bank’s criteria of eligibility reads: “Displaced persons may be classified in one of the following three groups: (a) those who have formal legal rights to land ... (b) those who do not have formal legal rights to land ... but have a [recognizable] claim to such land or assets ... and (c) those who have no recognizable legal right or claim to the land they are occupying. Persons covered under...(a) and (b) are provided compensation for the land they lose, and other assistance.... Persons covered under...(c) are provided resettlement assistance in lieu of compensation for the land they occupy, and other assistance, as necessary, … if they occupy the project area prior to a cut-off date…”

5. Apart from the 30 hospitals under the Addis Ababa Health Bureau (AAHB), there are 11 more hospitals in the city managed by government agencies and NGOs. Amanuel, St Paul, St Peter, and Alert hospitals are run by the Federal Ministry of Health, while Fistula, Balcha, and Abebech Gobena hospitals are administered by NGOs. The Police Hospital belongs to the Federal Police Commission. The army has two hospitals. Tikur Anbesa (or Black Lion) Hospital is managed by Addis Ababa University. Except for St Paul, Balcha, Abebech Gobena, and Black Lion Hospital, the rest either accept certain categories of people (e.g., police officers) or treat only certain diseases.

6. Before the relocation, she used to sell vegetables on the street to support her family and pay her college tuition. After the relocation to Akaki, she could not continue the vegetable business for lack of space in Piassa to keep the unsold items. Hence, she switched to selling cigarettes, chewing gum, and other

* (PhD), Assistant Professor, Department of Sociology and Social Anthropology, Addis Ababa University. Email: gebre@sosa.aau.edu.et
smaller items that she could carry in the bus. Inability to pay the tuition forced her to drop out of the college programme.

7. Informants also mentioned about other guidelines that were not followed: (1) that the condominium houses should be made ready before the actual movement of people, (2) the dislocates should be offered the chance to choose places for relocation, and (3) that people should be relocated to the nearest places as much as possible.

REFERENCES


submitted to the Department of Sociology and Social Anthropology, Addis Ababa University and the Chr. Michelsen Institute.


Gebre Yntiso. *Urban Development and Displacement in Addis Ababa* 77


